

ROY CITY PLANNING COMMISSION

March 27, 2007

Minutes of the Roy City Planning Commission Meeting held in the City Council Room of the Roy City Municipal Building on March 27, 2007, at 6:00 p.m.

The meeting was a regularly scheduled meeting designated by resolution. Notice of the meeting was provided to the *Standard Examiner* at least 24 hours in advance. A copy of the agenda was posted.

The following members were in attendance:

Bill Merx, Chairman	Tony Reynolds, Community
Doug Allred	Services Director
Dave Collins	Mark Larson, Planner
Brad Hilton	Mark Miller, City Engineer
Gennie Kirch	Michelle Drago, Secretary
Karlene Yeoman	

Others present were: Councilwoman Marge Becraft; Councilman Larry Peterson; Councilman Dave Tafoya; Steve Meyer; Liz Scanlon; Bert Visser; Cloy Child; Larry Talbot; Relea Talbot; Steve Alder; Sue Alder; Lee Lipsey; Chris Lipsey; Pam Harrison; Harold Lancer; Dave Bennion; Sharon Bennion; Glen Jacobsen; Jill Jacobsen; Kelly Call; Brian Jenkins; Denny Faulkner; Dale Hansen; Toni Thompson; Sandra Miller; Paul Sorensen; Kathy Welchman; Kent Reddan; Dave Metcalf; Pat Metcalf; Jerry Leavitt; Eric Yarborough; Maria Collents; Alex Collents; Jack Belt; Alison Stander; Ray Page; and Leon Wilson.

Pledge of Allegiance: Dave Collins

1. APPROVAL OF MARCH 13, 2007, MINUTES

**Commissioner Yeoman moved to approve the minutes of March 13, 2007, as written. Commissioner Kirch seconded the motion. Commission members Allred, Collins, Kirch, Merx, and Yeoman voted "aye." The motion carried.**

Commissioner Hilton arrived at 6:01 p.m.

2. PUBLIC HEARING TO CONSIDER A CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT AND SITE PLAN FOR A COMMUTER RAIL STATION PARKING LOT LOCATED AT APPROXIMATELY 4155 SOUTH 2400 WEST AND PUBLIC HEARING TO CONSIDER PRELIMINARY APPROVAL OF THE ROY STATION SUBDIVISION

Commissioner Kirch moved to open the public hearing to consider a conditional use permit for a commuter rail station parking lot located at approximately 4155 South 2400 West at 6:02 p.m. Commissioner Yeoman seconded the motion. Commission members Allred, Collins, Hilton, Kirch, Merx, and Yeoman voted "aye." The motion carried.

Commissioner Kirch moved to open a public hearing to consider preliminary approval of the Roy Station Subdivision. Commissioner Yeoman seconded the motion. Commission members Allred, Collins, Hilton, Kirch, Merx, and Yeoman voted "aye." The motion carried.

Mark Larson stated that UTA had requested approval of a conditional use permit for a commuter rail station parking lot and preliminary approval of the Roy Station Subdivision. The site was 21.90 acres located on the south side of 4000 South at approximately 2450 West. The proposed subdivision would consist of four lots that would be divided by a road that would eventually continue south and connect to the existing 2675 West. Lot Nos. 1 and 2 would contain the first phase of the commuter rail parking lot. Lot No. 3 was for future expansion. Lot No. 4 was surplus. Utilities for the subdivision would be installed in the road. The utilities would be continued when the road was extended. There were some existing utility easements in the subdivision for sanitary sewer and storm drains. UTA was not proposing to construct buildings or restrooms. The proposed project would not increase culinary water or sanitary sewer demands. The City was only considering a conditional use permit for Phase No. 1. Phase No. 1 consisted of the entire construction of the road and street improvements; the bus turn around; the kiss-and-ride lot; a parking lot on Lot No. 2 for 580 parking stalls; and temporary landscaping of Lot No. 3. Lot No. 3 was for future expansion. Its temporary landscaping would consist of natural plants and grasses. The road right-of-way dedication would be 66 feet in width. The existing frontage road north of 4000 South would be realigned with the 2450 West 4000 South intersection. Mr. Larson said the overall landscaping plan included trees along the street, islands in the parking lot, and the perimeter of the parking lot. A 5-foot high monument sign was planned at the entrance on 4000 South. The sign would also be part of Phase No. 1. The lighting plan showed the location of the poles

in the parking lot. The light poles would be 20 feet in height. The existing slope and proposed landscaping would provide a visual buffer for the existing homes to the east. Phase No. 2 would include additional parking. It would require a separate approval. UTA would be required to maintain Lot No. 4 in accordance with the City's Nuisance Ordinance.

Commissioner Collins asked what Lot No. 4 would be sold for. Mark Larson said Lot No. 4 was surplus property. It was currently zoned R-1-8, which was a single-family residential zone. Any use besides single family would require a rezone.

Mark Larson said UTA had submitted a traffic study that indicated the number of vehicular trips on its opening day would be 274 vehicular trips with 41 trips per hour in the peak a.m. and 41 trips per hour in the peak p.m. The study summarized that the traffic generated by the commuter rail parking lot would not significantly impact the traffic network around the site.

Commissioner Collins asked if the person who prepared the traffic study took into consideration the future commercial development planned to the west. Mark Larson did not know. The study included 30-year projections.

Mark Larson stated that the City was interested in purchasing part of Lot No. 4 for a future reservoir site. The acquisition would actually create two additional lots that needed to be shown on the preliminary plat as Lot Nos. 5 and 6. The Development Review staff was concerned about some utility changes relating to storm water, the need for a third party verification of UTA's traffic study, access to the kiss-and-ride parking lot, whether the existing lighting plan was sufficient, where the 4-foot high chain link fence was proposed along the road in relation to the road right-of-way and the parking lot, and more landscaping buffer between the parking lot and the road.

Commissioner Allred asked what part of Lot No. 4 would be included in the current proposal. Mark Larson said Lot No. 4 was only being considered as a lot in the proposed subdivision. It was surplus property that would be maintained by UTA and sold 'as is.' Commissioner Allred felt UTA should do something for erosion control on Lot No. 4 because of its steep grade.

Commissioner Collins asked if the road would be private. Mark Larson said it would be dedicated to the City. Commissioner

Collins asked if the City would maintain it. Mark Larson said it would. That was the reason for the cul-de-sac at the end.

Commissioner Hilton asked if the City had started to analyze the traffic impact on 4000 South. Mark Larson said the City had selected a traffic engineer, but it had not reached any conclusions yet.

Commissioner Collins asked who would maintain the parking lot. Mark Larson said UTA would be responsible for shoveling snow, maintaining the fence, and refuse pickup.

Steve Meyer, UTA, stated that they had been working with Roy City for two years. He updated the Planning Commission and the audience on the status of the overall project. They were planning to open in 2008. The Roy project would be done in two phases. Phase No. 2 was future parking. It would be built when there was a demand. UTA could add a landscaping buffer between the parking lot and the road. In order to do that, UTA would have to steepen the slope between the parking aisles. The fence could be moved behind the sidewalk with additional openings for pedestrian access.

Mark Miller stated that the City might want to consider public sidewalk on one side of the street. Then there would be a better landscaping buffer on the east side and pedestrian traffic could still be channeled.

Steve Meyer said there was no question that the traffic on 4000 South would be impacted. However, he felt the impact would be less than the impact of a residential subdivision. In order to mitigate the traffic, UTA had widened 4000 South to allow for a deceleration lane on the south side. UDOT was moving ahead with plans for the Midland Drive extension. UDOT hoped to begin construction in 2009.

Chairman Merx asked about the realignment of the frontage road. Steve Meyer said that raised medians would be installed at every crossing. That meant the current access to the frontage road would be right turn only for both ingress and egress. UTA was working with the property owner on the north side of 4000 South to acquire access to realign the frontage road with the proposed 2450 West 4000 South intersection.

Steve Meyer felt the frequency of service planned by UTA would spread the traffic out. They planned to have 60 to 70 trains a day, which was a train about every 30 minutes. Union Pacific currently had 36 to 45 trains a day.

Commissioner Yeoman asked how long the UTA trains would block traffic on 4000 South. Steve Meyer felt the arms on 4000 South would drop for about one minute for a commuter train. That was similar to the impact of a traffic signal.

Commissioner Collins asked if the trains would be free from the intersection before they stopped. Mr. Meyer said they would.

Steve Meyer stated that UTA planned to offer bus service to the Roy station. UTA was also looking at the possibility of a van share for Hill AFB. UTA planned to install about 550 feet of platform to begin with. That was long enough for six cars. Eventually the platform would be lengthened to accommodate 10 cars.

Chairman Merx opened the floor for public comments.

Bert Visser, 4883 South 2500 West, felt the public hearing was invalid because the road proposed by UTA did not meet the City's master plan. He also felt the notification provided by the City was inadequate. Mr. Visser understood that when the City began talking with UTA about the Roy station that 2675 West would be completed. Now he found out that about 420 feet of orchard would separate the two ends of 2675 West. It didn't make sense to not finish the road. For years he and other developers had tried to get the City to make 2675 West narrower. He felt UTA should have to build a road to match the existing width of 2675 West, which was about 80 feet. He didn't feel the station should be approved until 2675 West was extended. He didn't understand why UTA hadn't talked with Leon Wilson, owner of the adjoining orchard, about extending the road. It would be less expensive to complete the road now than it would be later. He didn't feel 4000 South could handle more traffic.

Cloy Child, 3883 South 2257 West, was concerned about the children in the area that walked to nearby schools. Four Thousand South (4000 South) was already a traffic hazard. People did not yield for southbound traffic on 2275 West attempting to make east bound left turns on 4000 South. He felt the road proposed by UTA should be widened.

Commissioner Yeoman asked how many cars could back up on 4000 South before the 2450 West 4000 South intersection would be impacted. Steve Meyer estimated that 10 cars could be backed up. He agreed that during peak hours there was a steady stream of traffic on 4000 South.

Commissioner Collins stated that there were no turn lanes at the intersection of 2450 West 4000 South to separate right and left hand traffic movements.

Denny Faulkner, 3733 South 2100 West, stated that he had spoken with both the staff and the Mayor about opening up 2675 West. What did the City find?

Tony Reynolds stated that there were several alternatives for opening up 2675 West. The first was for UTA and Leon Wilson, the property owners, to want 2675 West to extend through their properties. The second alternative was for the City to require UTA to provide a secondary access because of the amount of traffic generated by the proposed use. The third alternative was to wait until the Wilson property was developed. The fourth alternative was for the City to negotiate a purchase of the property to construct the roadway.

Jack Belt, 4131 South 2300 West, stated that his property backed up to Lot No. 4. He felt the 300 foot notification distance provided by the City was insufficient. He felt the parking lot proposed by UTA was poorly designed. The amount of crosswalks was insufficient. If utilities were located in the street, any repairs would shut the street down. He felt it would be better to put the utilities in the parking lot. He was concerned about the lighting and how it would affect his property. He felt 4000 South should be widened to four lanes from 1900 West to Midland Drive with an overpass over the tracks. The traffic signals at both ends needed to be more traffic friendly. He couldn't tell if the proposed landscaping was adequate. He felt there needed to be more than was shown. He didn't feel 4000 South could handle more traffic. Opening up 2675 West to the south seemed like a very good answer.

Steve Meyer stated that there were two things that helped with the lighting - the grading and the design. The parking lot was lower than the adjoining homes, and the proposed lighting would be focused down. Light would not escape to the side. UTA didn't want lighting to affect adjoining homes and properties. However, they did need sufficient light to keep the parking lot safe.

Commissioner Collins asked about the illumination level. Steve Meyer felt the lumen lighting level would be 4 to 6.

Jack Belt asked who would patrol the parking lot. Steve Meyer felt it would be a combination of UTA and Roy City.

Glen Jacobsen, 4170 South 2400 West, asked if the parking lot would be lit 24 hours a day. Steve Meyer said that it would. However, during the hours trains weren't running the amount of light would be minimized. Trains would run between 5:30 a.m. and 11:00 p.m. Mr. Jacobsen asked about keeping the site clean. Mr. Meyer said that would be handled by the facility managers. Mr. Jacobsen asked about the plans to sell the surplus property. Mr. Meyer said that as soon as the subdivision was approved, UTA would begin the process to dispose of the surplus property. Mr. Jacobsen asked if the proposed road was the same width as a regular City street. Mr. Meyer said it was.

Tony Reynolds stated that the City's Transportation Map in the City's General Plan contained different classifications of roads. There were arterial streets and collector streets. The standard width of an arterial street right-of-way for Roy City was 84 feet; a collector street right-of-way was 66 feet. The Transportation Map showed 2675 West from 4000 South to 4800 South, as both already constructed and planned, as a collector street.

Bert Visser asked if Leon Wilson would also be allowed to develop his property with a 66-foot road right-of-way. Tony Reynolds said that is what the City's General Plan called for.

Eric Yarborough, 3973 South 2275 West, was concerned about the speeds at which traffic moved through his neighborhood. What was the City going to do about it? The proposed UTA station would affect at least a square mile all the way around it. It would affect his street.

Alison Stander, 3915 South 2275 West, stated that the dump trucks used by UTA traveled through her neighborhood at very fast speeds. There were no sidewalks in her neighborhood, and the traffic speeds were dangerous. She was very concerned about her children.

Commissioner Collins sympathized with her concerns. However, he felt they should be addressed to the Police Department and then the City Council, not the Planning Commission.

Ray Page, 4217 South 2450 West, said Alison Stander was his daughter. He felt the Planning Commission was ignoring her concerns. He was very worried about a road in front of his house becoming a secondary access for the station. A road in Lot No. 4 would be inevitable, even if it was not part of UTA's proposal. When that road went in, there would be a lot of traffic in front of his property. That was poor planning. There were better ways to

funnel the traffic from this site. He was also concerned about the lack of a fence between his property and UTA's lot. UTA had taken a lot of dirt from behind his home. Would it stay that way? Tony Reynolds said UTA would be required to construct the site to the plans that would be approved by the City.

Steve Meyer stated that the Police Department had asked UTA to look at how the site would affect the surrounding traffic circulation. That is why there was a future road shown on one of the overall site plans. UTA could not predict what would happen with the surplus property. The site was a challenge because of the existing grades. It had to be safe. If the City approved an unsafe plan there could be liability involved.

Commissioner Hilton asked why construction vehicles were traveling through a residential neighborhood. People in the audience said the construction vehicles had to use residential streets because UDOT had narrowed the turning radius. It was physically impossible for them to make the westbound right-hand turn at 4000 South 1900 West.

The Planning Commission asked Councilwoman Becraft to see what could be done about that problem.

Commissioner Kirch stated that when the Midland Drive extension was completed, it would draw traffic off of 4000 South. During the environmental study, the surrounding neighborhood suggested that the surplus property to provide a buffer between the parking lot and the existing neighborhood. She asked the neighbors to be proactive in recording license plates for speeding vehicles and calling the respective construction companies.

A gentleman who lived on 3950 South asked if the City was going to use eminent domain. There were residents on 4000 South who were concerned about being thrown out of their homes. Four Thousand South (4000 South) was already congested. The UTA station would just add to it. The Planning Commission said UTA's proposal did not impact any homes.

Ray Page asked if the surplus property would be sold for a commercial use.

Commissioner Kirch stated that the entire area was zoned for single family residential. There had been discussion about what type of development to allow around the hub. This was a residential neighborhood, which the City planned to maintain. There was

commercial development proposed around 4000 South and Midland Drive, not the UTA station. Most of Roy City's east/west roads were used by growth to the west as access to I-15. UDOT's plans for the Midland Drive extension offered some hope.

Chris Lipsey, 3995 South 2075 West, stated that she could not back out onto 4000 South now. When trains blocked traffic, cars would back up all the way to 1900 West. Traffic arms would not solve anything. She felt a traffic light needed to be added at the 2450 West 4000 South intersection.

Commissioner Hilton felt the City could look at some of those issues when it conducted the traffic analysis.

Leon Wilson, 4302 South 2675 West, was concerned about how landscaping would be handled at the end of the cul-de-sac and storm water run off. Mark Miller stated that UTA had provided a fairly detailed layout as part of the site plan. He had made some notes he would require UTA's engineer to address. Mr. Wilson said 100% of his living currently came from his farm. If a road was put through his farm, it would no longer be viable. When he didn't want to farm any longer, he would sell, and the 2675 West would be finished. When that happened, something would have to be done to move the traffic better at 4800 South 2675 West.

**Commissioner Collins moved to close the public hearing to consider a preliminary approval of the Roy Station Subdivision at 8:15 p.m. Commissioner Allred seconded the motion. Commission members Allred, Collins, Hilton, Kirch, Merx, and Yeoman voted "aye." The motion carried.**

**Commissioner Collins moved to close the public hearing to consider a conditional use permit for a commuter rail parking lot at 8:15 p.m. Commissioner Hilton seconded the motion. Commission members Allred, Collins, Hilton, Kirch, Merx, and Yeoman voted "aye." The motion carried.**

Commissioner Allred felt the way the current design of the parking would be difficult to maneuver traffic through. The entrance to the kiss-and-ride lot at the end of the cul-de-sac was a mess. Steve Meyer said the grade difference made locating the entrance to the kiss-and-ride lot a challenge. Mark Miller said the Fire Marshal was concerned that emergency vehicles could block the entrance to the kiss-and-ride lot. He had spoken with UTA's

engineer about offsetting the cul-de-sac to the east side of the road to allow for a more typical entrance to the kiss-and-ride lot.

Mark Miller was concerned about the grade difference between the end of the cul-de-sac and Leon Wilson's property. He would continue to work with UTA's engineer until a design was found that both UTA and Roy City were comfortable with. He was also concerned about the traffic impact this development would have on 4000 South.

Commissioner Allred asked if the intersection of 2450 West 4000 South needed to be widened to create turn lanes. Mark Miller said a 66-foot road allowed a left turn lane, a right turn lane, and an ingress lane. A 66-foot road provides 42 feet of pavement.

Mark Miller stated that there would have to be a transition when the two ends of 2675 West connected because of the different widths.

In response to a question from Commissioner Yeoman about storm water, Mark Miller said UTA would have to provide storm water calculations and flows on the approved plans.

Commissioner Kirch was not comfortable forwarding the conditional use permit and site plan to the City Council. There were questions UTA still needed to answer. She was concerned about redesigning the cul-de-sac and storm water data. Two additional weeks would give UTA time to answer questions about traffic and storm water.

Commissioner Allred felt the traffic issues were outside of the site plan. Mark Miller felt the issues should be considered as part of the site plan approval because at this point, the City did not know what type of impact UTA would have on 4000 South. The City was waiting to see what recommendations came from Dr. Joe Perrin, a third party who was reviewing UTA's traffic study.

Chairman Merx stated that the traffic projections in UTA's traffic study did not seem consistent with the amount of parking stalls being constructed.

Commissioner Hilton stated that when the Planning Commission updated the General Plan in 2002, it felt 4000 South was a critical street. The Planning Commission decided to wait until the commuter rail station was in place and was making an impact before conducting a traffic count to determine if the classification of 4000 South needed to be upgraded.

Commissioner Allred stated that road construction was always behind the need. The Planning Commission had considered three different sites for the commuter rail station. It selected 4000 South because it felt that location would have the least impact on traffic. UTA had responded to the City's concerns.

Commissioner Collins felt the Planning Commission could list its concerns in a motion to the City Council.

Commissioner Hilton stated that on a project of this magnitude, the Planning Commission needed to gather all the information it could before making a recommendation to the City Council.

**Commissioner Hilton moved to table consideration of a conditional use permit for a commuter rail station and preliminary approval of the Roy Station Subdivision for two weeks and directed UTA to work with City staff to address the following concerns:**

1. The location of the fence, adding 5 feet of landscape buffering, and the location sidewalk of the on the east side of 2675 West;
2. Storm water and erosion and how they would affect neighboring properties
3. Rework the entrance to the kiss-and-ride lot and the function of the cul-de-sac;
4. Improve the vehicular and pedestrian flow through the parking lot on Lot No. 2;
5. Fencing between the park-and-ride site and adjoining properties;
6. A lighting study;
7. A third party traffic analysis; and
8. Adding Lot Nos. 5 and 6 to the subdivision plat.

Commissioner Yeoman seconded the motion. Commission members Allred, Collins, Hilton, Kirch, Merx, and Yeoman voted "aye." The motion carried.

The Planning Commission took a short break from 8:53 to 9:02 p.m.

3. PUBLIC HEARING TO CONSIDER AMENDING THE TRANSPORTATION ELEMENT OF THE GENERAL PLAN

**Commissioner Hilton moved to open the public hearing at 9:02 p.m. Commissioner Kirch seconded the motion. Commission members Allred, Collins, Hilton, Kirch, Merx, and Yeoman voted "aye." The motion carried.**

Tony Reynolds stated that both Public Works and the City Engineer had recommended that the Transportation Map in the General Plan be amended to change 2500 West from 4800 South to 5600 South and 2675 West from 4800 South to 5600 South from arterial roads to collector roads. Both roads were existing. Mr. Reynolds referenced the definitions of arterial and collector roads in the General Plan on Page 24. An arterial street is designed for through, or regional, travel. Collector streets are designed as two lane roads with average traffic volumes of 500 to 18,000 cars a day.

Commissioner Yeoman stated that 2700 West was shown as an arterial street. Did it need to be changed to a collector street as well? Mark Miller said it could be changed because it terminated at the south end of the City.

Commissioner Kirch asked about speed limits on arterial streets versus collector streets. Mark Miller said the designation of a street did not affect the speed limit. Typically the speed limit was lower on narrower roads.

Chairman Merx opened the floor for public comments.

Bert Visser stated that the Planning Commission already knew his sentiments.

**Commissioner Allred moved to close the public hearing at 9:14 p.m. Commissioner Yeoman seconded the motion. Commission members Allred, Collins, Hilton, Kirch, Merx, and Yeoman voted "aye." The motion carried.**

Commissioner Kirch moved to recommend that the City Council amend the Existing and Future Transportation Map of the Transportation Element of the Roy City General Plan 2002 by changing the designation of 2500 West from 4800 South to 5600 South from an arterial street to a collector street, changing the designation of 2675 West from 4800 South to 5600 South from an arterial street to a collector street, and changing the designation of 2700 West from

Planning Commission Minutes  
March 27, 2007  
Page 13

4800 South to the south end of the City from an arterial street to a collector street. Commissioner Hilton seconded the motion. Commission members Allred, Collins, Hilton, Kirch, Merx, and Yeoman voted "aye." The motion carried.

4. PUBLIC HEARING TO CONSIDER A CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT AND SITE PLAN FOR A DRIVE-THROUGH WINDOW LOCATED AT APPROXIMATELY 1952 WEST 5600 SOUTH AND SITE PLAN APPROVAL OF A RETAIL BUILDING LOCATED AT APPROXIMATELY 1964 WEST 5600 SOUTH

Commissioner Collins moved to open the public hearing at 9:16 p.m. Commissioner Hilton seconded the motion. Commission members Allred, Collins, Hilton, Kirch, Merx, and Yeoman voted "aye." The motion carried.

Mark Larson stated that the site plan for this development was not ready for the Planning Commission to consider. He asked that the hearing be continued.

Commissioner Hilton moved to continue the public hearing to April 10, 2007, at 6:00 p.m. Commissioner Kirch seconded the motion. Commission members Allred, Collins, Hilton, Kirch, Merx, and Yeoman voted "aye." The motion carried.

5. ADJOURN

Commissioner Kirch moved to close the public hearing at 9:17 p.m. Commissioner Hilton seconded the motion. Commission members Allred, Collins, Hilton, Kirch, Merx, and Yeoman voted "aye." The motion carried.

---

Bill Merx  
Chairman

Attest:

---

Michelle Drago  
Secretary

dc:pmar2707